

Scholarship Programs as Public Diplomacy Tool and Implementations in Turkic Council Countries*

Muhammet Musa Budak**

Hacı Murat Terzi***

Abstract

Public Diplomacy which continues to increase its importance alongside traditional diplomacy, become essential part of foreign policy of states. There are many activities in this content carried by governmental and nongovernmental institutions to gain consent of people. The article first defines the concept of public diplomacy in its diverse angles, then discusses the scholarship programs as they are considered important part of this emerging phenomenon. In this context, different countries' scholarship programs and their implementations in Turkic Council member states will be analyzed. Turkic Council member countries' scholarships programs, particularly Turkiye Scholarships will also be assessed. The views of students who benefited from this program, which also be evaluated in terms of educational sociology will be shared. This article tries to compare scholarship programs of external powers and member states. Effectiveness of member states' scholarship programs, if any, on development of bilateral and multilateral relations will be questioned. Analyses will be on country and regional level. Possibility of creating new exchange programs for Turkic Council member states will be evaluated. Suggestions will be made for such program's structure that are suitable to regional conditions and considering similar programs implemented by different actors. The aim of the study is to raise awareness about the development of relations through scholarship programs and to contribute to the development of joint exchange programs.

Keywords

Public diplomacy, soft power, scholarship programs, Turkic Council, Turkiye Scholarships, sociology of education, Central Asia.

* Date of Arrival: 13 September 2019 – Date of Acceptance: 09 April 2020

You can refer to this article as follows:

Budak, Muhammet Musa ve Hacı Murat Terzi (2021). "Scholarship Programs as Public Diplomacy Tool and Implementations in Turkic Council Countries". *bilig – Journal of Social Sciences of the Turkic World* 96: 229-253.

** Dr., Independent Researcher – Ankara/Turkey
ORCID ID: 0000-0002-9666-4316
mmbudak@hotmail.com

*** Dr., Independent Researcher – Ankara/Turkey
ORCID ID: 0000-0002-0788-2216
hacimuratterzi@gmail.com

Introduction

Developments in information and communication technologies have brought new dimensions to the methods to maximize states' interests and the concept of power in international relations. In the international system, which is being restructured with the revolution in the fields of information and communication, and legitimacy came to the fore in the post-Cold War period. Besides bilateral relations the skills of influencing foreign public opinion have gained importance. Information, communication, culture and public opinion has become the key words in this new era. Political structure, economic potential and cultural values of the countries gained importance as a tool of foreign policy. Having a strong hold only in the political and military fields has lost their competence especially when non-state actors, especially NGOs and multinational companies, are increasingly effective. So, having tools to affect the public agenda has also become more important for countries. Changing perceptions of threats, especially after September 11, pushed almost all western countries, especially the USA, to revise their security strategies. Debates on the concept of power have begun in the reshaped international system. According to new perspectives, the best way to understand and make use of power in the most effective way is to see that the power has "hard" as well as "soft" elements. At the same time, it is determined that these two forces are in very close contact with each other and in a constantly nourishing relationship (Nye 2005).

Soft power includes all the elements of value a country produces rather than its military and economic strength; culture, education, art, written and visual media, film, poetry, literature, architecture, higher education (universities, research centers, etc.), non-governmental organizations, science and technology infrastructure, innovation capacity, tourism, economic cooperation platforms and diplomacy (PublicDiplomacy 2019). Resulting from the combination of these elements, soft power also reveals the depth of a country's social capital. Consent and attractiveness are another vital point of soft power concept which enable people to act in cooperative manner. In this context, soft power which is identified as the ability and capability of using political, economic and cultural values of a country to make other countries accept its course with consent rather than using military options, has come to the fore (Nye 2005).

Public Diplomacy is nourished from soft power components and boosts it in parallel manner, and it is more effective in the regions where cultural, political and historical influences of the countries exist. Using means of soft power Public Diplomacy regarded as a government communication strategy that aims to explain the ideals, national goals and current policies of its country to foreign peoples. On contrary to classic one, public diplomacy use bilateral communication with the public and mostly not only from government to public but also from public to public (Kalin 2012). The main idea of public diplomacy is to communicate directly with foreign public in order to influence the opinions of people and to try to create a positive image about a country's policies, actions, economic and political systems. Public diplomacy envisages bilateral communication and interaction in both directions. In other words, it involves learning about the opinions of foreign publics as well as sending a message to those publics. Education is one of the most important field when it comes to this mutual learning process.

International student mobility is regarded as an important tool of public diplomacy as it enhances mutual understanding, cooperation and solidarity between countries, cultures and contributes to global peace (Bevis & Lucas 2007: 27). Such programs carried out to spread values, cultures and languages of countries. Scholarship and exchange programs, which are human-oriented, can make a significant contribution to the perceptions that implementing countries want to create in the long term. Countries' scholarship programs in education are part of public diplomacy activities, which aim to inform, shape and direct the public opinion of other countries towards their own national interests (Lima 2007). These programs contribute to efforts for informing other societies in terms of recognizing and understanding the assets and values of the countries. Permanent perceptions of countries can be established through direct contact between the peoples of different countries.

According to Nye, since scholarship programs mostly affects the elite, even one person can have a major political impact in today's international relations. For example, Aleksandr Yakolev was highly influenced by working with David Truman, a political scientist at the University of Colombia in 1958. Later, Yakovlev became a member of the Politburo of Communist

Party of the USSR, and the one who influenced the Soviet leader Mikhail Gorbachev in liberalism. The soviet exchange student in the US Oleg Kalugin, a senior official at the KGB, looked back in 1997 and said, “The exchange programs were the Trojan Horse for the Soviet Union. It played a major role in the collapse of the Soviet system. For years, more and more people have continued to be infected.” (Nye 2005: 50-51).

The scholarship programs, which has historically been carried out for different purposes, is now regarded as an important means for transferring cultural values as well as economic wins by developed states and multinational organizations (such as the European Union). As part of public diplomacy activities, scholarship programs are understood as a process of communication, not a propaganda. Because the way to ensure inter-state integration is primarily through increasing cultural and social associations. One of the easiest and lowest cost of this is scholarship programs. Today, many developed countries consider scholarship programs as an important instrument of diplomacy (Nye 2005: 60).

Some of Scholarship Programs in Different Countries

The strategic priority of international student mobility, which is of great importance in terms of cultural interaction, knowledge production, sharing and transferring of knowledge as well as economic development, personal development, socialization and professional achievement, is gradually increasing in the context of public diplomacy. Many countries implement national strategic policies in the context of political-cultural strategy and economic return. Today, countries such as the USA, the UK, France, Germany, China, Russia and the EU program of Erasmus stand out in international student mobility (Küçükcan and Gür 2010: 58-62). These countries are developing strategic plans in this area and gaining in many ways.

The Fulbright Program (the USA)

The US one of the prominent countries use international student exchange programs to foster her interest in many ways. Fulbright program, which is leading exchange program of the US, was created by the US Congress in 1946 after World War II to develop a common understanding between countries through education and cultural exchange. The program, supported by the

Department of Education and Cultural Relations of the US Department of State and run by the International Institute of Education (IEE). It provides scholarships to local and international students, teachers and academicians. 76% of the program budget, which was approximately 442.9 million dollars in 2015, is financed by the US Government. The program, which is implemented in more than 150 countries, is carried out by the Fulbright commission composed of the US and related country representatives established in 49 countries, while the Public Relations Department of the US Embassies in countries where the commission is not available. Since the Fulbright Program's inception in 1946, more than 370,000 Fulbrighters from over 180 countries and territories have participated in the Program (State 2016: 24-33). According to the evaluation of the US Department of State, participation in the program indicated that 97% mutual understanding, 92% earned leadership skills, 89% had the ability to work closely with other cultures, and 71% had the ability to lead others (Snow 2019: 238).

“Cultural influence” and soft power mechanisms are actively used by the US in Central Asian countries. The United States strives to influence especially the elite population and aims to consolidate its position in the education market of Central Asia. Accordingly, Fulbright Program continues her programs in the region. Once Turkic Council member countries considered the program allocated grants to 5270 individuals from 1946 to 2016. Only in 2016-17 period 126 Turkic Council member states' citizens granted under the program. At the same year 180 American citizens studying on these countries benefited from Fulbright scholarships (FFSB 2018). Besides scholarship program the US is very active in the region through its universities as well. Several universities (the Kazakh-American University in Almaty and the American Central Asian University in Bishkek) were established for this purpose. According to the American Central Asian University, the institution was established in 1993 “to train future leaders in Central Asia on democratic transformations” (Plotnikov 2016: 174-175). In addition to Fulbright Program and American universities in the region, there are many funds for educational activities supported by the US government or private institutions based in the US such as the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), National Assistance for Democracy (NED). The US continues to operate in the region with great financial support for the adoption of American values (perceived as

universal human values in Washington) by the people of the region through educational programs and projects.

Russia

Russia, started scholarship programs as early as 1865, has 120.000 international students who continue their education under the State Scholarship Program. Approximately 34.000 of these students are from former Soviet Union states of Central Asia (Bureau 2019). Russia introduced new legal regulations in 2013 to receive 15.000 student each year under its scholarship program to attract more international students. One of the most important advantages of Russia in its educational projects in the region is Russian language. After the collapse of the USSR, the share of Russian language in the Central Asian countries has decreased in first years. Because of the new actors in the region Russians had experienced a great competition in the field of education. But it is seen that the popularity of Russian schools has increased again now a days. Russian public institutions, such as the Russkiy Mir Foundation, are trying to support universities in Central Asian countries in the field of Russian studies and culture as well as creating new centers. There are 6 Russian universities or branches in Kazakhstan, 8 in Kyrgyzstan, 2 in Tajikistan and 1 in Uzbekistan (Plotnikov 2016: 172-173). People of major cities in Kazakhstan and the majority of Kyrgyzstan speak Russian. In addition, Russian is most common language at the cities of Uzbekistan, Tajikistan and especially Turkmenistan. The prevalence of the Russian language in the region gives the Russia advantage and facilitates the domination in the field of education.

Russia considers Central Asia as not only a cheap labor and raw material market but also *lebensraum*. Any social, economic and political developments in the region effects Russia directly as it has very huge diaspora originated from Central Asian countries. This increases the sensitivity of Russian politics in Central Asia, including the field of education. Russia is interested in maintaining the influence of Russian culture and its country's dominant image in Central Asia. For a long time, the Central Asian countries were part of the Russian Empire and then the USSR. During this time, Russia was perceived by the population of the region as "a power that modernizes Central Asia". According to Russian intellectuals, thanks to Russian language and Russian culture, the peoples of Central Asia joined the European civilization.

The outstanding representatives of the intellectuals of this region, such as Chingiz Aitmatov, for example, claim to have opened to the world through Russian language (Khanazarov 1963). Therefore, Russia poses many unique advantages in Central Asia compared to other international actors. Such as common historical past with the region's countries; Russian as the most widely spoken language and as an immigration zone for a significant part of the active population of Central Asia (not only for work but also for study). These sources allow Russia to successfully use the "soft power" mechanisms in Central Asia, especially through education field.

CSC (China)

China, which conducts scholarship programs through The China Scholarship Council (CSC), aims to provide financial support to Chinese students who wish to study abroad and to create opportunities for international candidates who wish to continue their education in China (Latief & Lefen 2018). Through scholarship programs, China aims to strengthen the relations of understanding and friendship between Chinese people and the peoples of region while developing bilateral relations with Central Asian countries and to introduce China's socialist development model all over the world (CSC 2011:13-14).

Economic growth of China increases its need for energy resources in Central Asia. The Central Asian region is considered not only as a source of raw materials in Beijing, but also as a market for Chinese products and as a transit route for the transportation of Chinese goods to Europe. China's economic expansion in Central Asia could lead to the growth of Chinese phobia which will harm Chinese interests in the region. To avoid this scenario, the Chinese authorities engaged in different activities to expand their cultural and human ties to create a positive image in this post-Soviet region. According to Kazakhstan expert R. Izimov, Chinese policymakers have decided to use more soft power instruments in their foreign policy, so in the near future (according to Chinese standards, that near future is about 10-15 years), thousands of international students studying outside of China will be very useful. According to Beijing's strategy, China aimed to spread Confucius Institutes in Central Asian countries to create a positive image in the eyes of the local people, to promote the Chinese cultural heritage in Central Asia, to spread Chinese trade experiences to Central Asian countries (Izimov 2016).

In 2013, 10 Confucius Institutes and 12 Confucius Classes were opened in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan. There are approximately 23 thousand students in these training centers (RNC 2014).

There is extensive and long-term cultural expansion of China in Central Asian region. As a result, it is desirable to “connect” the region to Beijing, both economically and culturally. All these developments will provide a suitable basis for supporting Chinese interests in the region. The unequal imbalance of China’s economic and demographic sources with the Central Asian countries may lead to marginal and paradoxical transformations in the region. On the other hand, China’s infrastructure investments can stimulate regional economies.

European Countries

European powers have active joint and special scholarship programs which are implemented in Central Asian countries. The most important joint program of Europe in the region is Erasmus Program (European Region Action Scheme for the Mobility of University Students). The program was launched in 1987 later evolved to Erasmus+. It is a EU’s program to support education, training, youth and sport in Europe and partner countries. With the budget of €14.7 billion the program provides opportunities for over 4 million people to study, train, and gain experience abroad. Erasmus+ has opportunities not only students, but also for a wide variety of individuals and organizations as well (Commission, Erasmus+, 2019). In 2015, Erasmus+, through “International Credit Mobility” program, opened new opportunity for universities which can set up mobility agreements with partners around the world to send and receive students and staff. Especially universities from Turkic Council member states had opportunity to exchange their academics and students to enhance internationalization of their institutions (Europe Commission 2018). With these different programs, Erasmus+ aims to promote the sustainable development of its partners in the field of higher education and contribute to achieve the objectives of the EU Youth Strategy, as well as spread the “European values” to neighboring countries. In the scope of the program 3 projects implemented in Azerbaijan and Kazakhstan in 2017 with the budget of €2.601.750 (Commission, Erasmus+, 2019).

Once special programs of each European country considered, Chevening of the UK, DAAD of Germany, Campus France are particularly important as Central Asian countries are part of these programs. The British Council, which focuses on education and culture, was established in 1934 to provide a better understanding of the values and ideas of the British people in other countries and to strengthen common cultural traditions with the former colonies. In line with the public diplomacy approach of the UK, the British Council's main objective is to build mutually beneficial relationships between people in the UK and other countries, and to increase the value of Britain's achievements among other peoples. The British Council has 191 offices in 110 countries. Established in 1983, Chevening, which has been run by the British Council and funded by British Foreign and Commonwealth Office, allocated more than 50.000 professionals to study in the UK. Chevening Awards are an important element in Britain's public diplomacy effort and bring professionals, who have already displayed outstanding leadership talents, to study in the UK. Chevening has alumni associations in Azerbaijan, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan (Chevening 2019).

The German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD), founded in 1925, is the largest body organizing international student and researcher exchange activities in Germany. Today, it has provided financial support to more than 1.5 million students and academics, as well as contributing to the internationalization of German higher education, encouraging German language and German studies, establishing German universities in developing countries and supporting German decision makers for policy making in the fields of culture and development (DAAD 2019). DAAD uses an annual budget of around € 558 million to reach these strategic objectives. DAAD has 15 regional offices and 57 information centers around the world some these offices are in Ankara, Istanbul, Baku, Almaty, Tashkent and Bishkek. In the period of 1950 - 2011, 1.02 million foreigners gained German experience within the scope of DAAD, while 1.46 million Germans were provided with international training opportunities in the same period (G. A. DAAD 2019). In the post-war period, some 5 million young people from Germany and France were included in the program, and efforts were made to eliminate the negative perceptions of centuries between the two countries and to lay the foundations of European integration (DAAD 2019). In 2018, DAAD provides funding to 301 people from Azerbaijan,

716 from Kazakhstan, 439 from Kyrgyzstan, 224 from Uzbekistan (G. A. DAAD 2019).

Campus France organization was established in 2010 to promote French higher education all over the world, to coordinate services for international students and to promote international student mobility. Continuing its activities with 256 offices and branches in 123 countries, Campus France promotes the country's higher education and provides consultancy services to relevant students (CampusFrance 2019). Campus France provided 29.766 scholarships in 2017, with the organization's budget of € 29 million in 2017. Program uses media platforms to promote France and its education. To do so it operates 80 websites in 32 languages (France, Activity Report 2017 A Year of Action 2018). Increasing the reputation of French education through studies and researches to be done in the country's higher education through scholarship programs, supporting the growth of the education sector that contributes to the economic development of the country and most importantly, France scholarship programs are used as an important tool to increase the political effectiveness (Affairs 2008). In 2017-18 academic year 3.967 students from Turkey, 546 from Kazakhstan, 580 from Azerbaijan, 183 from Uzbekistan studied in France (France, Country Data Sheets 2019).

Short History of Relations Between Turkic Council Countries

Nearly thirty years have passed since the collapse of the USSR; since then the new independent states (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan) have many commons such as geography, history, culture, language and religion. Anyhow these countries have little experience in state formation. Problems of self-identification and ethnic divisions both in the states and people's level have been very sharp in the post-Soviet period. Up to date, the Central Asian countries have been able to overcome multifaceted problems in their inter-regional and multilateral relations. However, this did not create a completely non-conflict environment in the region. The conflicts about border regions, interactions between ethnic relations, conflicts in the use of water wealth, make the relations between states still difficult. Therefore, despite different attempts to form regional organization, it has not been possible to establish any multilateral regional unity that will fully unite the Central Asian states.

But the unsuccessful individual experiences of the actors to achieve regional security and economic development; international political and economic factors force countries of Central Asia to create common platforms to face such challenges. The most important problem faced by the new states was the adaptation and integration to the world economy and new global political conjuncture. The Turkic Council established in 2009 with the Nakhichevan Agreement; one of the most important cornerstones in the post-Soviet period in the region for the institutionalization and regularization of the relations through the unity of language, culture and history. Cross-border cooperation mechanism, such as the Turkic Council, has the potential to create the regional market and pave the way for the circulation of goods, services, capital and labor. At the same time, it is possible to establish expected unity in the region by implementing joint investment projects, increasing educational and cultural cooperation. Such opportunity can be seen from the views of students who participated interviews for this article.

Today, the most promising field of cooperation is education. Common culture, language and history of the Turkic Speaking States are the main pillars that underpin the cooperation under It was symbolic that the Second Summit of the Turkic Council was held under the theme of “Educational, Scientific and Cultural Cooperation” (T. Council 2019). One of the outcomes of meetings, Turkic Council - Turkic Universities Union was established to realize cooperation in the field of higher education between the member countries of the Turkic Council. Aim of this organization are to develop cooperation and cooperation between the higher education institutions of the member countries in order to develop friendship and cooperation among Turkish speaking peoples based on common history, cultural and linguistic heritage (Union 2019).

To fulfill its aims Turkic Council - Turkic Universities Union newly initiated Orhun Exchange Program to facilitate mobility of student and academic personnel between member universities of the union. Another exchange program which create opportunity for students and academics of Turkic Council countries is Mevlana Exchange Program of Turkey. The program enables the exchange of students and teaching staff between higher education institutions in Turkey and higher education institutions abroad (MevlanaProgramı 2019). Scholarship programs, like Turkiye Scholarships

of Turkey, Bolashak of Kazakhstan, Youth Association Scholarships of Azerbaijan support mobility of students and academics in the region.

Scholarship Programs of Turkic Council Countries

Member of Turkic Council Turkey, Azerbaijan and Kazakhstan conducted different scholarship programs for students. In the case of Azerbaijan and Kazakhstan, these scholarship programs are generally aimed at promoting education in the country and rewarding successful students. Programs create opportunities to send students abroad in order to meet the human resources needed in the country's development. Türkiye Scholarships program implemented by Turkey is unique example in the region which provides opportunity to other countries students to study in Turkish Universities. This program become very important public diplomacy instrument of Turkey in the Central Asian region. Scholarship programs of concerned countries, their objectives and contribution of these programs to regional cooperation differs in each country.

Türkiye Bursları (Turkey)

After the end of bipolar international, Turkey's geostrategic position gained new importance. As it is located at the hearth of Central Asia, Turkey had opportunity to be gateway for Europe, the Middle East, Caucasus, Mediterranean and Black Sea regions. To get advantage of this opportunity Turkey adopted new foreign policy to reach all these regions. Great Student Project (BÖP) is one of them in education field. BÖP, which was initiated in 1992 with 5 countries (Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan), became a large project covering 57 countries in 2011 (Vural and Alkan 2009: viii). Within the framework of the project carried out by the Ministry of National Education, 42,318 scholarship quotas were allocated until 2011, but 31,037 of them were used. The number of students graduated from the project was limited to 8,914 (Budak 2012: 66). Unsatisfactory results and difficulties faced during the implementations lead Turkey to initiate new scholarship program.

In 2011, International Student Strategy Document was prepared under the leadership of the Presidency of Turks Abroad and Related Communities (YTB). According to new strategy, quality of services offered to international students improved, processes for application and admissions become more

transparent and easier for students from different educational backgrounds. New guidance services for international students offered, services planned to cover even after graduation of students to continue relations with Turkey. Most importantly financial supports for international students improved dramatically. So the applications to Türkiye Scholarships has increased from 4 thousand in 2012, in the first year of new program, to more than 130 thousand in 2018 (TürkiyeBursları 2019). Positive effects of Türkiye Scholarship program not only for human capacity building in needed fields but also creating affirmative views and thoughts on image of Turkey will be shared following section of the article.

Table 1. *International Students in Turkish Universities (2017-2018)* (YÖK 2019)

	Male	Female	Total
Total Number of International Students	81706	43324	125030
TURKSOY Full and Observer Member Countries	24309	11686	35995
Azerbaijan	12911	4177	17088
Kazakhstan	1051	1014	2065
Kirghizstan	1105	821	1926
Moldova	175	225	400
Uzbekistan	435	405	840
Russia	808	621	1429
Turkmenistan	7824	4423	12247
Total Number of Graduate and Post-Graduate Students in Turkish Universities	2622936	2168678	4791614
Rate of International Students	3,12%	2,00%	2,61%

In addition to Türkiye Scholarship Program, Turkey opened Yunus Emre Cultural Centers in Turkic Council states such as Azerbaijan and Kazakhstan with mission of enhancing Turkey’s recognition, credibility and prestige. To this end Turkish Cultural Centers in Baku and Nur-Sultan organize cultural / artistic programs and classes to teach Turkey’s Turkish (YEE 2019).

Youth Association Scholarships (Azerbaijan)

A state scholarship program has started in Azerbaijan as early as 2006to cover human source needs of the country. The program covers the educational expenses of Azerbaijani students who study abroad in education programs

determined by the scholarship program. Within the scope of the program, a certain amount of scholarship is provided to cover the students' tuition fees, round-trip tickets and monthly expenses. Scholarships have been granted, particularly in areas of lack of qualified staff such as technology, engineering and economics. The program covered all levels of higher education.

Students who would like to receive scholarships firstly should get admission from foreign universities and programs listed on the program. Then they will apply through the program's website for scholarship and the eligible candidates are interviewed. Those who successfully completed the processes are entitled to receive scholarships and started their education abroad. At the end of each semester, they had to send the transcripts through the same website. In 2019, another scholarship program administered by Ministry of Youth and Sport replace the State Program. The priority educational fields are education and training, management sciences, humanities, culture and fine arts, economic and administrative sciences, natural sciences, technical and technology sciences, agricultural sciences, health, welfare and service sciences (Fondu 2019).

Bolashak (Kazakhstan)

The Center for International Programs (the CIP) is known in the world educational market as an administrator of "Bolashak" Presidential International Scholarship, which has been providing the most talented students from Kazakhstan with a unique opportunity to get higher education at the best universities all over the world for 25 years (Bolashak, Ustav Obshestva 2009).

The CIP has extended its authority and set a new bar – the implementation of intergovernmental agreements and various international educational programs – with the main aim of informing prospective applicants about the opportunities to obtain an education abroad. There are many activities carried out by the institution such as information campaign (advertising, information support) and the promotion of universities in all regions of Kazakhstan (spreading information about the conditions and advantages of studying, degrees, programs, etc.) Besides that, assistance in the development of dual award programs with local universities (finding suitable partners, etc.) and assistance in opening branch campuses of universities and language centers (faculties, departments) in Kazakhstan, either on the

basis of Kazakhstani universities or as a separate institution are targets of the institution. Assistance in the development of academic mobility programs for students and academic staff between Kazakhstan and other countries on the basis of the agreement making information campaign about scholarships to the potential talented students is another role of the institution (Bolashak, History of the Program 2019).

Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan

Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan, member states of Turkic Council, are not at the expected level in terms of scholarship programs. Scholarship programs implemented by governments in these two countries are mostly in the form of awarding high-achieving students within the country. To achieve the expected cooperation among the countries of Turkic Council, multi-faceted scholarship programs should be started, albeit with limited quota. When the high rates of young population and development needs of these countries are taken into consideration, the need for cooperation in the field of education once again stands out.

Establishment of mutual universities such as International Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Turkish-Kazakh University; Kyrgyz-Turkey Manas University also play vital role at development of relations between countries in education field. International Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Turkish-Kazakh University established in 1993, has 8659 students in 2018-19 academic year and 1372 of them are from Turkic Council countries. The university had 439 academic personnel in 2018. Since its establishment 1171 students from Turkey graduated from the university (University 2019). Kyrgyz-Turkish Manas University, established in 1995, had its first students in the 1997-1998 academic year in the fields of Turkology, History, Management, and Computer Engineering. In the 2017-2018 academic year, there were a total 5,950 students (837 of them international students) studying in 9 faculties (Humanities, Sciences, Economics and Management, Theology, Communications, Engineering, Veterinary Medicine, Agriculture, and Arts), 3 schools (Physical Culture and Sports, Tourism and Hotel Management and Foreign Languages), and one School of Vocational Education. There are currently 442 faculty and staff members (%41 of them are international instructor) and 298 administrative personnel working in management, finance, and upkeep of the university (Manas 2019).

All these efforts are not enough considering the scholarship programs of the other countries mentioned in the previous section. Budget and the number of persons included in the mobility programs of the US, Russia, China and European countries are much more than those of Turkic Council member states. Only Erasmus+ program of EU is offering more opportunities to states of the region under name of partner countries. Results of interviews with student who benefited from Turkiye Scholarship program underline importance of such programs for development of bilateral and multilateral relations between Turkic Council member states.

Views of Students Studying in Turkey from Central Asian Countries

Experiences of existing scholarship programs beneficial for understanding to what extent such programs contribute relations between countries of Turkic Council and their people. Conducting studies and surveys helps to enhance scholarship programs effectiveness. To this end some students from Central Asian countries studying in various universities of Ankara had interviewed on scholarships programs and regional relations of their countries (list of questions and participated students given at Annex). In the interviews, it was tried to get the opinions of the students who benefited from the scholarships about their gains during the education process in Turkey as well as their ideas on development of cooperation between the Turkish Republics. Having opinions and suggestions of beneficiary students of scholarship programs strengthen this studies outcome to develop such programs.

Once they were asked about their chose of Turkey for education, all students who participated in the interviews stated that before arriving to the country, they had been feeling an emotional affiliation to Turkey. But through studying in Turkey, they had chance to have not only feelings but knowledge and consciousness about reasons of such closeness. Dyikanbek (Azerbaijan) said that: "I always wanted to come to Turkey for my further studies and Turkish Scholarship Program make this dream came true and I learned a lot not only about my field but also the real life here in this brotherly country." Academic fields which they plan to study, opportunities of scholarships provided and academic developments in Turkey as well affected their choses.

All those interviewed stated that education in Turkey contributed significantly to their academic development. An important part of the candidate mentioned beyond emotional affiliation to Turkey during their educational process they gained the opportunity to learn about realities of the country. As stated by Mehmet (Turkey): “Not an education which get from university but most importantly friends from Turkic countries who I met during my study opened new horizons to me. I learnt from them so much about Turkic countries and their life’s and traditions.” Students gained experience and knowledge about other Turkish Republics countries and related communities. Turkmen, Uzbek and Kyrgyz students have also said that addition to their study they gained information on the possible commercial and investment opportunities between Turkey and their countries in. Azeri, Kyrgyz and Uzbek students stated that they saw important opportunities in tourism as well. All students stated that increasing cooperation in the field of education and scholarship opportunities contribute to the development of mutual relations between countries.

Almost all the students were aware of the institutions such as Turkic Council, TURKSOY, TİKA and YTB. It is stated that these institutions will contribute to the promotion of Turkish Language and Culture and to improve relations in the Turkish Republics. In addition to this, it was mentioned that Kyrgyzstan Manas and Hoca Ahmet Yesevi Universities in Kazakhstan play an important role in the integration of the Turkish Republics. It should be noted that Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan, which will celebrate their 30th anniversary of independence in 2021, have overcome many political, economic and social problems for thirty years and have undergone a major transformation in transition from state socialism to market economy and democracy. The most fundamental reforms were made for national identity and national state building. It was tried to create a healthy society by eliminating the damage caused by Soviet ideology to national and spiritual values. In this context, education and cultural policies played the most important role. Turkic Council, founded in 2011, has made a significant contribution to cultural rebirth in the new independent Turkish republics. The achievements of the Turkish Republics in the process of thirty years of independence and the experience of multilateral cooperation within Turkic Council have enabled new formations to emerge (Purtaş 2012).

The students who were interviewed made suggestions such as developing joint scholarship programs for the development of relations, cooperating more in the field of education, making joint productions in the field of cinema and television, organizing joint sports games, and teaching of the languages of other Turkish Republics in schools. Such ideas of young people of the region assures that the way of integration in Central Asia is through education and cultural interaction. One of the most important elements of public diplomacy is language teaching and that is the most effective ways of spread the culture and story of the countries. Turkish is currently spoken by 220 million people. Turkish, which is the fifth most spoken language after Chinese, English, Spanish and Hindi, has an important advantage among the languages in the world and Central Asia in particular. In this aspect, attempts to increase Turkish language influence among world languages is important for not only for Turkey, but also for all Turkish-speaking countries.

Today, the most important problem in front of the cultural integration among the Turkic peoples is the lack of an effective common communication language among the Turkic republics. In the realization of this objective, which is a long-term and challenging process, it is vital to spread the use of Turkish language as lingua franca. It will need long time special efforts for the Turkish language to become the language of communication due to the Russian domination of nearly 150 years in Central Asia and the Caucasus and works of methodologists such as Ilminski during this era. However, the prerequisite for this is to increase exchange programs, trade and joint business practices in all areas and at all age levels.

Another important issue in the interviews with students is the need for academic studies in the field of student mobility. During the interviews, students stated that they would like to work to increase awareness about importance of scholarship programs and their contribution to the development of bilateral relations. So, outcome of such programs, graduates, can be catalyzer for promotion of exchanges in the region. These programs avail peoples of the Central Asian countries to know their educational, cultural and economic assets and they will realize more about their similarities and differences. As public diplomacy requires exchange will interact people of the region by hand of their own sons and daughters.

Conclusion

Countries use scholarship programs to spread their values, cultures and languages and see these activities as effective public diplomacy activities. These human oriented efforts can contribute to the people's perception of the implementing countries in the long term. Countries of Central Asia, which has the assets of thousands of years of civilization, have very important potential to play as global power in the world affairs if they can accumulate this asset with strategic cooperation with each other. Graduates of Turkish universities and their associations should be supported due to their potential for Central Asian integration. They have very important role to transfer know-how and tradition of countries. Connection with such associations should be constant, their support for improvement of relations shall be achieved.

Scholarship programs play very vital role to realize strategic targets of such organizations. Exchange programs between France and Germany created new human capacity for improving bilateral relations after the hundred years of wars which lead to establishment of European Union. As discussed in the article, once scholarship programs of Turkic Council states' scholarship programs compared with other programs huge gap can be realized. Especially number of students enrolled programs of the US, Russia, China and European countries much higher than those of Turkic Council countries. According to data reached, budget allocated to such programs of Turkic Council is not enough to reach scope of other powers. Attempts to create common exchange programs also limited once needs considered. But as mentioned by students from the region hopes to develop such efforts are very promising. Turkish republics can create the human resources that will build the integration after such long-term separation period through such scholarship programs. Views of students shows how such programs can help positive image of countries for next generation of the region.

Erasmus program administrated by EU is one of the examples can be implemented in Turkic Council member countries. Initiatives of such exchange programs shall be encouraged and supported. Surveys on participated student shall be carried to strengthen weak points of current programs. International students have high potential for sociological surveys for projects to be implemented. Technical assessments to elaborate academic

and physical capacities of universities for such exchange programs should be done. Studies may be encouraged to create not only full degree programs but also short-term courses for know-how transfers at scope of scholarships programs. Political will and enforcement from member states has critical importance. Needed capacity and sources allocation by member countries are vital for successful outcomes of such programs.

References

- Akteleuov, Askar (2011). *diapazon.kz*. 30 June 2011. <https://diapazon.kz/news/22091-v-aktobe-otkrylsja-institut-konfucija> (Accessed: 8 September 2019).
- Bevis, Teresa B. and Chistopher J. Lucas (2007). *International Students in American Colleges and Universities: A History*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Bolashak (2019). *History of the Program*. <https://www.bolashak.gov.kz/en/o-stipendii/istoriya-razvitiya.html> (Accessed 8 17 2019).
- Bolashak. "Ustav Obshestva." *Bolashak*. 11 18. <https://www.bolashak.gov.kz/ru/o-kompanii/uchreditelnye-dokumenty.html> (Accessed: 17 August 2019).
- Budak, Muhammet Musa (2012). *Kamu Diplomasisi Araci Olarak Öğrenci Değişim Programlari ve Türkiye Uygulamalari*. Expertise Dissertation. Ankara.
- Campus France (2019). *Campus France Offices Around the World*. <https://www.campusfrance.org/en/Campus-France-offices-world> (Accessed: 25 August 2019).
- Campus France (2018). *Activity Report 2017 A Year of Action*. Paris: Campus France.
- Campus France (2019). *Country Data Sheets*. Paris: Campus France.
- Chevening (2019). *About Chevening*. <https://www.chevening.org/about/> ((Accessed: 4 September 2019).
- Chinese Scholarships Council (2011). *Annual Report 2010*. Beijing: CSC.
- CSC (2011). *Annual Report 2010*. Beijing: Chinese Scholarship Program.
- DAAD (2019). *About the DAAD*. <https://www.daad.de/der-daad/ueber-den-daad/en/> (Accessed: 4 September 2019).
- DAAD (2019). German Academic Exchange Service. *Annual Report 2018*. Bonn: DAAD German Academic Exchange Service.
- DAAD (2019). German Academic Exchange Services. *Budget and funding bodies*. <https://www.daad.de/der-daad/zahlen-und-fakten/en/30736-budget-and-funding-bodies/> (Accessed: 4 September 2019).
- EMC for PublicDiplomacy (2019). *What is Public Diplomacy?* 17 November 2019. <http://fletcher.tufts.edu/Murrow/Diplomacy/Definitions> (Accessed: 17 November 2019).

- European Commission (2018). *Erasmus+ International Credit Mobility Handbook for Participating Organisations*. Brussels: European Commission.
- European Commission (2019). *Erasmus+*. https://ec.europa.eu/programmes/erasmus-plus/about_en (Accessed: 25 August 2019).
- European Commission (2018). *Report From The Commission To The European Parliament, The Council, The European Economic And Social Committee And The Committee Of The Regions Mid-term evaluation of the Erasmus+ programme (2014-2020)*. Brussels: European Commission.
- FFSB (2018). *J. William Fulbright Foreign Scholarship Board 2017 Annual Report*. Washington: U.S. Department of State.
- Fondu, Gənclər (2019). *Gənclər üçün imkanlar*. <https://youthfoundation.az/action/foryouth> (Accessed: 24 August 2019).
- International Hoca Ahmet Yesevi University (2019). “Facts.” *International Hoca Ahmet Yesevi University*. <https://www.ayu.edu.tr/sayilar> (Accessed: 16 October 2019).
- Izimov, Ruslan (2016). *Naselenie Kazakhstana Vse Eshhe Sklonna Vdet Ugrozu V Litse Kitaya (Население Казахстана все еще склонно видеть угрозу в лице Китая)*.
- Kalın, İbrahim (2012). “Türk Dış Politikası ve Kamu Diplomasisi”. *Kamu Diplomasisi*. Ed. Abdullah Özkan and Tuğçe E. Öztürk. İstanbul: Tasam Yay.
- Khanazarov, Kuchkar Khanazarovich (1963). *Sblijeniyе Natsiy i Natsionalniye Yazıki v SSSR*. Tashkent: Gos. Izd.
- Kulmaganbetova, Diana (2015). “V Astane Otkroyut Institut Konfutsiya”. 19 June 2015. <https://informburo.kz/novosti/v-astane-otkroyut-institut-konfutsiya-6867.html> (Accessed: 30 August 2019).
- Küçükcan, Talip ve Bekir S. Gür (2010). *Türkiye’de Yükseköğretim-Karşılaştırmalı Bir Analiz*. Ankara: SETA Yay.
- Kyrgyz-Turkish University of Manas (2019). “History.” *Kyrgyz-Turkish University of Manas*. http://intl.manas.edu.kg/en/about_manas/history (Accessed: 16 October 2019).
- Latief, Rashidand Lin Lefen (2018). “Analysis of Chinese Government Scholarship for International Students Using Analytical Hierarchy Process (AHP).” *Sustainability* 10: 1-13.
- Lima, Antonia F. Jr. De (2007). “The Role of International Education Exchanges in Public Diplomacy”. *Place Branding and Public Diplomacy* (Palgrave Macmillan) 3: 239-241.
- Mevlana Değişim Programı (2019). *Mevlana Değişim Programı*. <https://mevlana.yok.gov.tr/ana-sayfa> (Accessed: 15 October 2019).

- Ministry of Foreign and European Affairs French (2019). “Quality Charter for French Government Foreign Scholars 2008.” *Campus France*. 2008. https://law.najah.edu/media/filer_public/93/c7/93c7bbb3-9bca-4401-abb2-7ef3406749a4/eiffel_charte_qualite_uk.pdf (Accessed: 26 August 2019).
- Nye, Joseph S. Jr (2005). *Dünya Siyasetinde Başarının Yolu: Yumuşak Güç*. Ankara: Elips Kitap.
- Plotnikov, Dmitry Sergeevich (2016). ““Myakhkaya Sila” (“Мягкая Сила” Политики Китая, Турции, Ирана, России И США В Центральной Азии В Сфере Образования).” *Ars Administrandi*: 160-177.
- Purtaş, Fırat (2012). “Kültürel Diplomasi ve TÜRKSOY”. *Medeniyet ve Kültür Araştırmaları Merkezi*. 17 December 2012. <http://mekam.org/mekam/kulturel-diplomasi-ve-turksoy> (Accessed: 25 July 2019).
- Rahmonova, Abdurahmona (2017). *avesta.tj*. 25 September 2017. <http://avesta.tj/2017/09/25/den-instituta-konfutsiya-otmetili-v-dushanbe/> (Accessed: 11 September 2019).
- Russian Federal Statistics Bureau (2019). *Russian Federal Statistics Bureau 2016 – 2017*. http://www.gks.ru/bgd/regl/b18_11/Main.htm (Accessed: 24 July 2019).
- RNC (2014). *russian.news.cn*. <http://russian.news.cn/culture/2014-> (Accessed: 11 August 2019).
- Snow, Nancy (2009). “Valuing Exchange of Persons in Public Diplomacy”. *Handbook of Public Diplomacy*. Eds. N. Snow and P.M. Taylor. New York: Routledge.
- Turkic Council (2019). “Education & Science.” *Turkic Council*. 13 April 2019. https://www.turkkon.org/en/isbirligi-alanlari/education-science_4 (Accessed: 15 October 2019).
- Turkic Council Turkic Universities Union (2019). “History.” *Turkic Council Turkic Universities Union*. <http://turkunib.org/tr/site/index/#about> (Accessed: 15 October 2019).
- Türkiye Bursları (2019). *Hakkımızda*. <https://turkiyeburslari.gov.tr/tr/sayfa/hakkimizda/turkiye-burslari> (Accessed: 15 August 2019).
- U.S. Department Of State (2016). *J. William Fulbright Foreign Scholarship Board Annual 2016 Report*. Washington DC: Bureau of Educational and Cultural Affairs.
- Vural, F.T.Y and S. Alkan (2009). *Büyük Öğrenci Projesinin Değerlendirmesi (1992-2008)*. Ankara: ODTÜ Araştırmalar Koordinatörlüğü.
- Yunus Emre Enstitüsü (2019). <https://www.yee.org.tr/en> (Accessed: 15 September 2019).
- YÖK (2019). *Uyruğa Göre Öğrenci Sayıları Raporu*. Ankara: YÖK.

Annex

List of the Questions

- What could be the contribution of your education in Turkey to the development of relations between Turkey and your country?
- What areas should be given priority in the development of bilateral relations?
- How was your education in Turkey impact on the overview of the Turkish Republics?
- Can student mobility in the Turkish Republics improve the relations between these countries?
- What are the importance and duties of Institutions such as TURKSOY, Turkic Council, YTB, TİKA Manas University, etc. in the integration bags in the Turkish world?

List of Participated Students

Mehmet T., Turkey,
Kemal G., Turkmenistan
Gulzoda M., Uzbekistan
Tabriz J., Azerbaijan
Nodira M., Turkmenistan
Dyikanbek Shamshidin U., Kirgizstan
Nurzhan A., Kazakhstan
Tungysh A., Kazakhstan
Raisa A., Azerbaijan
Samara B., Kirgizstan
Shokhrukhbek O., Uzbekistan

Kamu Diplomasisi Faaliyeti Olarak Bursluluk Programları ve Türk Keneşi Üye Ülkelerindeki Uygulamalar*

Muhammet Musa Budak**

Hacı Murat Terzi***

Öz

Geleneksel diplomasi yanında önemini artırmaya devam eden *Kamu Diplomasisi*, devletlerin dış politikasının önemli bir parçası haline gelmiştir. Bu çerçevede devlet ve sivil toplum kuruluşları tarafından halkların rızasını kazanmak için birçok farklı faaliyet yürütülmektedir. Bu makalede önce kamu diplomasisi kavramı farklı açılardan ele alınacak, sonra da bu yeni kavramın önemli bir parçası olarak görülen burs programları tartışılacaktır. Bu bağlamda farklı ülkelerin burs programları ve Türk Keneşi üye ülkelerindeki uygulamaları analiz edilecektir. Türk Keneşi üye ülkelerinin bursluluk programları, özellikle Türkiye Bursları değerlendirilecek ve bu programdan yararlanan öğrencilerin eğitim sosyolojisi açısından da önem arz eden görüşleri paylaşılacaktır. Bu makalede diğer ülkeler ile üye devletlerin burs programları karşılaştırılmaya çalışılacaktır. Türk Keneşi üye devletlerinin eğer varsa bursluluk programlarının ikili ve çok taraflı ilişkilerin geliştirilmesindeki etkinliği sorgulanacaktır. Analizler ülke ve bölge düzeyinde olacaktır. Türk Keneşi üye ülkeleri için yeni bir değişim programının oluşturulması imkanı değerlendirilecektir. Bölgesel koşullara uygun ve farklı aktörler tarafından uygulanan benzer programları da dikkate alan bir program yapısı için önerilerde bulunulmaya çalışılacaktır. Bursluluk programları yolu ile ilişkilerin geliştirilmesine yönelik bir farkındalık oluşturulması ve ortak değişim programlarının geliştirilmesine bu çalışma ile katkı sağlanması amaçlanmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler

Kamu diplomasisi, yumuşak güç, bursluluk programları, eğitim sosyolojisi, Türk Keneşi, Türkiye Bursları, Orta Asya.

* Geliş Tarihi: 13 Eylül 2019 – Kabul Tarihi: 09 Nisan 2020

Bu makaleyi şu şekilde kaynak gösterebilirsiniz:

Budak, Muhammet Musa ve Hacı Murat Terzi (2021). "Scholarship Programs as Public Diplomacy Tool and Implementations in Turkic Council Countries". *bilig – Türk Dünyası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* 96: 229-253.

** Dr., Serbest Araştırmacı – Ankara/Türkiye
ORCID ID: 0000-0002-9666-4316
mmbudak@hotmail.com

*** Dr., Serbest Araştırmacı – Ankara/Türkiye
ORCID ID: 0000-0002-0788-2216
hacimuratterzi@gmail.com

Стипендиальные программы как инструмент публичной дипломатии и их реализация в странах-членах Тюркского Совета*

Мухаммет Муса Будак**

Хаджи Мурат Терзи***

Аннотация

Публичная дипломатия, значение которой продолжает расти наряду с традиционной дипломатией, стала неотъемлемой частью внешней политики государств. В этом контексте правительствами и неправительственными учреждениями проводится множество мероприятий с целью добиться согласия между людьми. В статье сначала дается определение концепции публичной дипломатии с различных точек зрения, а затем обсуждаются стипендиальные программы, которые стали важной частью этого нового явления. Проанализированы стипендиальные программы разных стран и их реализация в государствах-членах Тюркского совета. Также будут оценены стипендиальные программы стран-членов Тюркского совета, в частности, «Стипендии Турции». Мы поделимся мнениями студентов, которые имели возможность воспользоваться данной программой. В этой статье делается попытка сравнить стипендиальные программы различных стран и стран-участниц. Будет проанализирована эффективность стипендиальных программ государств-членов для развития двусторонних и многосторонних отношений. Анализ был проведен на страновом и региональном уровне. Будет оценена возможность создания новых программ обмена для стран-членов Тюркского совета. Будут внесены предложения по такой структуре программы, которая соответствует региональным условиям и учитывает аналогичные программы, реализуемые разными участниками. Цель исследования - повысить осведомленность о развитии отношений с помощью стипендиальных программ и внести свой вклад в разработку совместных программ обмена.

Ключевые слова

Публичная дипломатия, мягкая сила, стипендиальные программы, Тюркский совет, стипендии Турции, Центральная Азия.

* Поступило в редакцию: 13 сентября 2019 г. – Принято в номер: 09 апреля 2020 г.

Ссылка на статью:

Budak, Muhammet Musa & Hacı Murat Terzi (2021). "Scholarship Programs as Public Diplomacy Tool and Implementations in Turkic Council Countries". *bilig – Журнал Гуманитарных Наук Тюркского Мира* 96: 229-253.

**Д-р, независимый исследователь – Анкара/Турция
ORCID ID: 0000-0002-9666-4316
mmbudak@hotmail.com

***Д-р, независимый исследователь – Анкара/Турция
ORCID ID: 0000-0002-0788-2216
hacimuratterzi@gmail.com